



Journal of Hospitality, Leisure, Sport & Tourism Education

Vol. 3, No. 1.

ISSN: 1473-8376

www.hlst.ltsn.ac.uk/johlste

COMMENTS AND REJOINDERS

Finding the Hospitality Industry: A Response to Brotherton *and* Slattery

Peter Jones (p.jones@surrey.ac.uk)

University of Surrey

Guildford, Surrey, GU2 7XH, UK.

DOI:10.3794/johlste.31.69

© Journal of Hospitality, Leisure, Sport and Tourism Education

Having spoken about the state of the art in the field of hospitality (Jones, 1998; Jones, 2001) I read with interest Paul Slattery's critique (Slattery, 2002a) concerning hospitality conceived as three domains – private, social and commercial – as proposed in the book *In Search of Hospitality: towards a theoretical framework*. Slattery uses typically robust language to dismiss what he calls the 'three domain approach' so it is not surprising that this provoked at least one response. Bob Brotherton (Brotherton, 2002) responds by accepting some of Slattery's arguments, whilst rebutting others, concluding that the notion of a 'three domains school of thought...is erroneous' (2002:72).

Given Slattery's strength of feeling on this topic, he follows up his first contribution with a reply to Brotherton's comments (Slattery, 2003). He writes, 'I read no dissent from the contributing authors in the book about the logic or validity of the three domain approach' (2003:119), suggesting that a school of thought *de facto* exists. Slattery (2003) can write quite accurately that no one shows dissent, but it is disingenuous of him to do so. He must know that the only people who read all the contributions to an edited text prior to its publication are the editors. Rarely, if ever, do contributors see in advance what other authors have written. This is confirmed by Brotherton (2003).

Furthermore, in doing so he infers something that he knows not to be the case. For Slattery is aware that at least two authors that contributed to the book *do* dissent from the approach it advocates. On more than one occasion, in print, he specifically comments (Slattery, 2002a; Slattery, 2002b) on the chapter authored by Lockwood and Jones (2000) as being different in tone and content to other chapters. Indeed he writes 'the promoters of the three domain approach ignore their arguments' (2002a:22).

I believe he formed this conclusion prior to discussing it with me personally, and when we discussed the book I was happy to affirm that neither Lockwood nor myself particularly advocated the three

Professor Peter Jones is the IFCA Professor of Production and Operations Management at the University of Surrey. He is the author or editor of nine textbooks and over 30 refereed journal articles, and has presented at numerous conferences around the world. He recently led a DTI-funded Industry Forum Adaptation Programme research team investigating UK best practice in the hospitality, tourism and leisure industry. In 2001, he was a member of the Research Assessment Exercise's Panel 43. He has been an HE quality assessor for both the HEFCE and SHEFC. He has a doctorate from the University of Surrey and an MBA from the London Business School.

domain approach. I specifically made the point that we had contributed to an edited text that intended to provide a *range* of alternative views of the hospitality industry, rather than advocate one particular view. I fear he may have forgotten our discussion in seeking to make his point as forcefully as possible.

Having clarified this, I would like to make two other points. First, I am quite happy to appear in print with other contributors to this controversial text. It could be argued that for too long hospitality academics have been defensive about their discipline and it was about time that some controversy entered our field. Second, I defend anyone's right to hold a different view to mine with regards our field of study. There is no absolutely 'right' perspective of hospitality, hospitality management or the hospitality industry.

References

- Brotherton, B. (2002) Finding the Hospitality Industry (A Response to Paul Slattery). *Journal of Hospitality, Leisure, Sport and Tourism Education* 1(2), 75-79.
- Brotherton, B. (2003) Finding the Hospitality Industry – A Final Response to Slattery? *Journal of Hospitality, Leisure, Sport and Tourism Education* 2(2), 67-70.
- Jones, P. (1998) Editorial. *International Journal of Hospitality Management* 17, 105-110.
- Jones, P. (2001) *Hospitality Research in 2001: Personal Reflections and Public Concern* (Keynote address). CHME National Research Conference, South Bank University, London, UK.
- Slattery, P. (2002a) Finding the Hospitality Industry. *Journal of Hospitality, Leisure, Sport and Tourism Education* 1(1), 19-28.
- Slattery, P. (2002b) Book Review. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management* 14(2), 98-100.
- Slattery, P. (2003) Finding the Hospitality Industry (Slattery's reply to Brotherton). *Journal of Hospitality, Leisure, Sport and Tourism Education* 2(1), 119-120.