International Perspectives on the Perceptions of Impact of Gaining Fellowship Aligned to the (UK)Professional Standards Framework

Dr Sarah Floyd       Ulster University
Vicky Davies         Ulster University
Dr Fiona Smart       Napier University
Dr Rachael Carkett   University of Bath
Dr Jason Davies      UCL
Mark Dransfield      YSJ
Professor Abby Cathcart QUT
Project Rationale: why do it?

• Number of schemes is growing rapidly

• Majority of fellowships are achieved through schemes

• We are all concerned about *impact*

• The elephant in the room – is there a connection between fellowship and the quality of the student experience
Methodology

• **Questionnaire:** A modified version of the HEA CPD Toolkit evaluation instrument (Kneale et. Al., 2015; PedRio, 2016) circulated to applicants who have achieved a category of fellowship through institutional routes to fellowship 2-3 years prior to the survey.

• **Reflective Commentaries:** Analysis of the quantitative and qualitative data (survey, interview and institutional data on reward and recognition) using a thematic analysis approach

• **Interviews:** with each institution’s Learning and Teaching senior manager focusing on key themes that arise from the survey data
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Nature of Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bath</td>
<td>UK, medium sized 1966 University with a reputation for excellence in teaching and research. The University Strategy sets out a vision to ‘be recognised as an international centre of research and teaching excellence’ with a mission ‘to deliver world class research and teaching’. 16417 students and 1190 academic staff.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>York St John</td>
<td>UK, small single-campus university with a church foundation. Its mission is to inspire students and staff to reach their full potential, advance knowledge, and make a positive contribution to the world. 6500 students and 345 academic staff. Currently ranked 3rd in the UK for staff with a teaching qualification.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UCL</td>
<td>UK, central campus in London with strong international links. The top UK university for research strength (REF 2014) and 7th in QS world rankings, UCL has recently committed itself to research-based education throughout its curricula. Around 4,000 teaching staff support around 38,000 students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edinburgh Napier</td>
<td>UK, post 92, public university with an international reputation for graduate employability. It provides socially, culturally and economically relevant higher education to people who can benefit from it. 958 academic staff, students &gt; 18,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ulster</td>
<td>UK, large distributed pre-92, University mission is academic excellence and civic engagement, 1283 academic staff, students &gt;28000. Top 4 for UK institutions on number of SFHEA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Queensland University of Technology</td>
<td>Australia, large public university with a strategic focus on real world learning and high-impact research. As a multi-campus institution, QUT accommodates an internationally awarded Science and Engineering Centre which incorporates the world’s largest digital interactive learning space (The Cube). QUT has 48,000 students and 2,200 fteaching staff.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Participant Characteristics (1) N= 324 (26-33%)

- 67% female
- 48% classified themselves as traditional academics
- 72% had no previous fellowship
- 78% had more than 5 years experience in HE
- > 20% said they were not in academic roles
- 51% gained fellowship >1 years ago, 16% > 2 years ago
Participant Characteristics (2)

- 69% gained fellowship via an experiential route
- 22% gained fellowship via a taught route

APPLICATION FORMAT

- Written: 41%
- Dialogic: 20%
- Multimedia: 4%
- SFHEA: 35%
- PFHEA: 4%
Does gaining fellowship have impact?

- Self
- Students
- Faculty
- Impact
- Peers
- Sector
- Institution
Impact on Self:

- 81% A/SA they wanted to demonstrate their practice
- 84% A/SA they wanted to gain recognition for their practice
- 77% A/SA the process would support them reviewing their practice
- 81% A/SA the process would support them enhancing their practice
- 86% have continued to engage in formal and/or informal CPD
- 78% claimed that the fellowship process influenced their L&T approaches
The dialogic experience has enabled me to identify this as an alternative assessment for one of the CPD modules that I deliver.

It gave me a much more thoughtful and informed approach to assessment and feedback.

I have increased my use of pedagogical materials in the classroom. Preparing for the dialogue reinforced for me that explaining to students why a certain approach to pedagogy is used helps them to accept and follow that approach and participate more effectively.

encouraged me to consider my role in a different way, to think beyond the pedagogy of the subject and to think about my relationship with students differently.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Overall average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The PSF dimensions are embedded in my practice</td>
<td>4.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I engage with a professional evidence base</td>
<td>4.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The fellowship process helped me to gain a deeper understanding of my practice</td>
<td>4.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I continue to reflect on my practice, in the same way, as I did during the prep of my fellowship</td>
<td>4.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I continue to engage with new areas of learning support and/or teaching activity</td>
<td>4.08</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I feel more like a 'proper' lecturer now (I come from a research background before moving into staff/student development role). I took the PgCert then applied for SF HEA through dialogue route to increase my confidence in my own practice and to strengthen my own identity as an 'academic'.
Were there any negative consequences of engaging with fellowship?

Opportunity Costs

- “time consuming and difficult within the pressures of existing work”, QUT
- “The significant time it takes to apply had impact on the rest of my work (and on my work-life balance”), University of Bath
- “It’s all trade-offs. I think I benefitted on balance, my students too. But it took time away from my research.” UCL
- “It was another thing that was added to my extensive workload but seeing as I work around the clock I doubt that anyone noticed.” Ulster
- “It took up time that could have usefully been applied to my real work. It also meant mixing with people who thought this had some value” York St John

Failure

- “I was unsuccessful the first time and that was upsetting for me”, Edinburgh Napier
- “It was brutal” Edinburgh Napier

Pigeon-hole

- “It [to some people] confirmed that I am not a researcher” QUT
- “A significant level of frustration and anger... in particular the need to engage with a particular style of rhetoric, to use specific buzzwords.” Ulster
- “There is still a cohort of more traditional staff who do not see why they should engage with these processes and who think that those who do are wasting their time.” UCL

Yes 19%
No 81%
Impact on Peers/ Department/ Faculty/ Institution
Has achieving fellowship been acknowledged (recognition)

- Colleagues 39%
- Line Manager 36%
- Senior Managers 21%
- Students 4%

They are not interested unless it is seen to be good for their reports.

I think students do not know what HEA fellowship means

Everybody in our institution seems to be doing it, so it is nothing special!

congratulatory email
Peers/ Colleagues

- 88% would recommend fellowship to colleagues
- A majority A/SA (4.22) that since gaining fellowship they were willing to support others applying

I have encouraged colleagues to apply for Fellowship and offered to review their applications and make suggestions of their practice that could be included in their applications.

only that I have more confidence in giving my opinion during curriculum development meetings etc.

It has forced me to take the time to reflect on my learning and teaching and, more importantly, to discuss this with my peers.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Impact and Influence on Others</th>
<th>Overall Weighted Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gaining fellowship has enabled me to further departmental (local) priorities in T&amp;L</td>
<td>3.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I have disseminated the learning I gained about the process of applying for fellowship</td>
<td>3.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I have disseminated the learning I gained about the (UK)Professional Standards Framework</td>
<td>3.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I have disseminated the learning I gained about approaches to L&amp;T</td>
<td>3.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaining fellowship has led to the emergence of new contacts/ networks in L&amp;T for me</td>
<td>3.31</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Impact on Students
Students:

Impact and Influence | Overall Weighted Average
--- | ---
Engagement with the fellowship process has impacted on the learning experience of my students | 3.47

Greater reflection brings changes, which have impacted on some of my approaches and therefore on some of my students.

Increasingly I explain my pedagogy to the students. This has improved student engagement.

I was encouraged to think about studentship, understanding the question etc., but most importantly, helped me to sympathise with student workloads and deadlines.
Discussion
Where next: Further analysis of data:

- Comparative analysis of quantitative data e.g. scheme vs taught/ different institutions, written vs dialogic…..?
- More detailed analysis of qualitative data – identification of themes
- Development of practice guide based on data
- Publications
References:


