Persuasion and Influence in Mentorship
A Presentation of PhD Research

Dr Claire McGuinness
Senior Lecturer

Professor Kay Currie
Director, WHO Collaborating Centre for Nursing Education, Research and Practice

Department of Nursing & Community Health
School of Health & Life Sciences
PRESENTATION OUTLINE

• Impetus for underpinning research
  • Investigation of the Work and Concerns of Supervising Mentors
• The Research Journey
• The Findings Diagrammatically
• The Story of the Findings ‘Made in My Image’
• The Myths and Facts about Persuasion
• Persuasion and Influence and the Supervising Mentor Role
  • Persuasion Theory
  • Psychology of Persuasion
  • The Process of Persuasion
• What next for Mentorship?
IMPETUS FOR THE RESEARCH

• Nursing and Midwifery Council (2006/2008)
  • *Standards to support learning and assessment in practice (SLAIP)*
    • Revised mentor preparation nationally
• Supervising Mentor Role
  • Absence of role parameters, guidance or preparation
  • Previously no national standardisation of mentor preparation for these registrants
• 2017 – Scottish Perspective
• NHS Education for Scotland
  • 2007 – labelling of role
  • 2009 – research recommended
  • 2013 – role guidance
• However, to date, no evidence of formal role research or investigation nationally
**RESEARCH AIM AND OBJECTIVES**

**Aim**
- To enter the world of supervising mentors wondering how they supervise student mentors, what their concerns are and how they act to resolve these concerns.

**Research Objectives**
- Through interaction with supervising mentors, explore their perspectives of their work in the role.
- To develop recommendations for the future practice of supervising mentors, both locally and nationally, and for future research in this field.
THE RESEARCH JOURNEY

Starting Out
Preliminary Literature Review
Research Aims & Objectives

Initial Sampling
Development & Distribution of Recruitment Questionnaire
Response Rate 9% (n=55)

2nd Stage (Theoretical) Sampling
Ongoing revision of interview questions

‘Made in My Image’
A Grounded Theory of Shaping and Moulding Mentorship Practice Through Persuasion and Influence

Aim – Substantive Theory Development
Explain the social processes underpinning the role

Data Generation with ongoing Comparative Data Analysis
Working with Participants (n=16) to Explore Experiences of the Role
‘Made in my Image – Shaping Mentorship Practice Through Persuasion and Influence’
THE STORY OF MADE IN MY IMAGE

• The main concern of supervising mentors
  • Ensuring registrants (student mentors) are fit for unsupervised mentorship practice

• They achieve this by **Shaping and Moulding** student mentor practice during supervision

• They achieve **Shaping and Moulding** by
  • Observing and assessing student mentor practice in the expectation that they will demonstrate behaviour aligning with their **image of a mentor** – addressing their main concern
  • Engage in teaching as and establish **influence** through **persuasion**

• **Shaping and Moulding** takes place as a consequence of the influence exerted through persuasion as part of the teaching process
OVERARCHING CONCEPT – IMAGE OF A MENTOR

• Image determined by, and parameters set as a consequence of
  • Previous experience as a student
  • Previous experience as a mentor
  • Previous and ongoing experiences and interactions with others as a registrant, mentor and individual in a variety of contexts
    • Other mentors and members of staff
    • Student mentor
    • Patients and families
    • Personal life
  • Expectations of the practice learning environment
  • Expectations and requirements of the profession
SOME MYTHS ABOUT PERSUASION

• Persuasion is not Manipulation

‘Manipulator’s exercise control over other people, usually against their will or against their best interests’.
(Van Dijk 2006; p360)

‘Manipulation infringes on autonomy because it bypasses a person’s ability to reason and/or treats them without respect’.
(Rossi & Yudell 2012; p194)
SOME MYTHS ABOUT PERSUASION

• Persuasion is not Coercion

‘The use of force, threat, restraint or compulsion to make someone do something or the use of power to impose one’s will on another’.
(Miller 2016; p167)

‘People tend to know when they are being coerced – it’s when feel they have no choice in their own decisions’
(Gossen 2007; p11)
• **Persuasion is not Negotiation** (Although negotiation can incorporate persuasion)

‘*Negotiating is the process of getting someone to do something, even if they disagree with it, by giving them enough concessions to make it worth their while. When you can’t win the other side’s agreement with the compelling power of your argument, you can usually buy it with concessions. Persuaders give reasons. Negotiators give concessions.*’

(Thomas 2006; p30)
• Persuasion is

‘Persuasion is entirely a matter of information management and processing, aimed at influencing the decisions made by the actor in his actor decision making sequence’.

(Funkhauser & Parker 1999; p33)

• Perloff (2003)
  • Those being persuaded are actively involved in deciding whether the message is valid or not
  • Persuasive message is introduced by the persuader
  • Receiver chooses to adopt the message content or not
    • Acceptance is dependant on their interpretation and understanding
  • Central tenets – the presence of free will, transparency and good intent all of which are indicative of the teacher-student relationship
Some Notable Authors – Persuasion Psychology & Theory

- **Aristotle** – rhetoric (logos, ethos, pathos)
- **Alexander** – persuasion as a metaphor for teaching
- **Cialdini** – psychology of persuasion/weapons of influence
- **Funkhouser & Parker** – action based theory of persuasion
- **Jesuino** – psychology of persuasion
- **Johnston** – art and science of persuasion
- **Perloff** – dynamics of persuasion
- **Petty & Cacioppo** – elaboration likelihood model of persuasion
- **Petty & Brinol** – psychology of persuasion
- **Skumanich & Kintsfather** – persuasion in organ donation
- **Tsai** – persuasion and paternalism
Aristotle

- Ancient Greek Philosopher – development of persuasion theory

Three Facets of Persuasive Communication

1. **Logos** – the logic of the argument
2. **Pathos** – empathy and emotion
3. **Ethos** - the credibility of the speaker
THE WORK OF SUPERVISING MENTORS

Logos (Logic)
- Continuing Professional Development
- NMC (2008) SLAIP

Pathos (Emotion/Empathy)
- Reflection on own experience as a student
- Good role models and not so good
- Enhancing the student experience
- Contributing to development of the profession

Ethos (Credibility)
- Own experience in the role is known
- Discussion of own experience
- Reputation – mentor and registrant
- Designation in the role
THE PERSUASION PROCESS

• Elaboration Likelihood Model (Petty & Cacioppo 1986)
THE WORK OF SUPERVISING MENTORS

• High Elaboration – Determinants (Central Processing)
  • Presence of Mentoring motivation
    • Collaboration and involvement
    • Positive shaping and moulding experience and outcome
  • Appropriate Mentor Selection – ability to process shaping and moulding messages
    • Aptitude for the role
    • Experience as a registrant in the area
    • Communication skills
    • Learning how to teach others
    • Being open to change and/or reinforcement
THE WORK OF SUPERVISING MENTORS

• **Low Elaboration Determinants (Peripheral Processing)**
  • *Absence of Mentoring Motivation* – potentially negative experience and short term *Shaping and Moulding*
  • *Inappropriate Mentor Selection* – inability or reluctance to process *shaping and moulding* messages
    • Risk of only responding to *peripheral cues* (Petty & Cacioppo 1986)
    • Revert back to pre-*shaping and moulding* state post supervised practice
    • No consistency in response – lack of inter-rater reliability
  • NMC Monitoring Requirement
WHAT NEXT FOR MENTORSHIP?

1. **NMC ongoing review/consultation**
   a) Pre-registration standards for nursing education & standards to support learning and assessment in practice

2. **Tap into expertise and experience of existing supervising mentors**
   a) Contribution going forward - revised NMC Standards

3. **Recognise supervising mentors’ knowledge and experience**
   a) Preparing others to teach and assess in practice

4. **Recognise the role of persuasion and the influence stemming from this**
   a) Encourage free will, transparency and collaboration
   b) Acknowledge the importance of good intent in supervising mentors
   c) Recognise teaching as a form of persuasion – develop improved understanding of persuasion in the practice education context
PERSUASION IN MENTORSHIP IS NOT
PERSUASION IN MENTORSHIP IS
References

References


Thank You for listening